



Contents

Preface: Why this book	xiii
Introduction: Debating Hinduism	1
Overview	1
Two opposing camps: continuity vs. discontinuity; unity vs. disunity	2
We are all jewels in Indra's Net	4
<i>Indra's Net and Buddhism</i>	13
<i>Influences on modern society</i>	15
Who is a Hindu?	18
Hinduism: Surfing Indra's Net	20
Framing the debate in three disciplines	22

PART 1 PURVA PAKSHA (Examination of My Opponents' Positions)

1. Eight Myths to be Challenged	29
Myth 1: India's optimum state is Balkanization	30

Myth 2: Colonial Indology's biases were turned into Hinduism	31
Myth 3: Hinduism was manufactured and did not grow organically	32
Myth 4: Yogic experience is not a valid path to enlightenment and tries to copy Western science	33
Myth 5: Western social ethics was incorporated as seva and karma yoga	35
Myth 6: Hinduism had no prior self-definition, unity or coherence	36
Myth 7: Hinduism is founded on oppression and sustained by it	38
Myth 8: Hinduism presumes the sameness of all religions	39
Summary of both sides of the debate	39
2. The Mythmakers: A Brief History	44
My wake-up call: How I discovered the myth	44
Missionary origins	46
Founders of the Myth of Neo-Hinduism	48
The Chorus Line	55
3. Paul Hacker's Construction of 'neo-Hinduism'	62
Initial romance with Advaita Vedanta and its personal influences on Hacker	62
Hacker starts his attack on contemporary Hinduism	64
Alleging political motives and appropriations from the West	68
Hacker on Vivekananda and the West	70
<i>Allegation 1: Importance of Direct Experience</i>	72
<i>Allegation 2: 'Tat Tvam Asi' ethic</i>	74
<i>Allegation 3: Nationalist agenda</i>	77
<i>Allegation 4: Inclusivism and sameness</i>	79

4. Agehananda Bharati on Neo-Hinduism as a 'Pizza Effect'	81
Pizza Effect: Indians copy Westerners	82
Hinduism deviates from Indian tradition	84
Fear of sexual impotence drives neo-Hindus	85
Bharati's definition of neo-Hinduism tenets	86
5. Ursula King's Bridge from Hacker to Rambachan	88
6. Rambachan's Argument to Fragment Hinduism	96
Using Shankara to shoot down Vivekananda	96
Issues with methodology	102
<i>Essentializing Shankara</i>	107
<i>Challenging the direct experience of the rishi-yogi</i>	110
<i>Is Rambachan fixated on Christian assumptions?</i>	113
<i>Allegation that yoga makes people less rational and intelligent</i>	117
<i>Political allegations</i>	118
Western scholars' support for Rambachan	119
Many scholars disagree with Rambachan	120
7. The Myth Goes Viral	125
Richard King	126
Brian Pennington	133
Peter van der Veer, Sheldon Pollock and others	137
Hindu leaders echo the chorus	143
Some academic defenders of contemporary Hinduism	145

PART 2 UTTARA PAKSHA (My Response)

8. Historical Continuity and Colonial Disruption	153
--	-----

x Contents

Integral unity in the sacred texts	155
The dynamics of insiders and outsiders	157
Samgraha: Harmonious organization of diversity	160
The ubiquity of samgraha texts throughout history	162
Swami Vivekananda follows his tradition's footsteps	169
The colonial disruption	170
<i>European debates: Are the Hindus Aryans or Pantheists?</i>	171
<i>Reduction into 'Indian schools of thought'</i>	174
<i>Postmodern and post-colonial distortions</i>	175
Challenging the Neo-Hinduism thesis	177
 9. Traditional Foundations of Social Consciousness	178
Western methodological straitjacket misapplied to Vivekananda	181
The 'world-negating' misinterpretation of social problems	185
Origin of Christian philanthropy	187
Conditions that led to the revival of Hindu seva	189
Sahajanand Swami and social activism in contemporary Hinduism	191
Swami Vivekananda's sevayoga	195
Challenging the Neo-Hinduism thesis	201
 10. Harmonizing Vedanta and Yoga	202
Vedanta's evolution at the time of Shankara	205
Theory of two realities	210
Yoga and classical texts	212
<i>Shankara's mentor's writing</i>	213
<i>Upanishads</i>	213
<i>Bhagavad-Gita</i>	215
Shankara's own kind of yoga: cognitive shift without action	217
<i>Systematic withdrawal from particular to universal</i>	217

<i>Dissolving the text/experience gap</i>	219
<i>Difference from Patanjali's Yoga</i>	221
<i>No causation is involved</i>	222
<i>Flexibility on anubhava</i>	222
Summarizing Shankara's posture on anubhava/yoga	226
<i>Respect for yoga</i>	226
<i>Yoga as preparation for higher practices</i>	227
<i>Comparing different levels of meditation, dhyana</i>	228
<i>Reasons for rejecting yoga at times</i>	229
Advaita Vedanta beyond Shankara	230
<i>Four historical periods</i>	231
<i>Vivekachudamani</i>	233
<i>Other later texts</i>	235
Challenging the Neo-Hinduism thesis	236
11. Mithya, Open Architecture and Cognitive Science	237
The unity of all existence	239
<i>Purna</i>	239
<i>Mithya as Relative Reality</i>	240
<i>Samavesha principle of integrality</i>	244
Common toolbox and open architecture	246
<i>Adhyatma-vidya</i>	250
<i>Rishis and cognitive science</i>	255
Robustness of the ecosystem over time	258
Challenging the Neo-Hinduism thesis	263
12. Digestion and Self-Destruction	264
The metabolism of digestion	264
The flea market of modern gurus	268

Digestion and the neo-Hinduism thesis	272
Conclusion: The ‘Poison Pill’ for Protection of Hinduism	273
Hinduism’s predicament today	274
The Porcupine Defence and the Poison Pill Protection	277
Astika and Nastika: Redefining the terms of the interfaith debate	282
The criteria for nastika: Principles that must be rejected	287
<i>History Centrism</i>	287
<i>Disembodied knowing and self-alienation</i>	288
<i>Synthetic cosmology</i>	291
<i>Fear of chaos</i>	292
Controversial implications of the Astika/Nastika approach	293
Refuting the myth of sameness	299
Poison pill versus digestion	304
How the poison pill strategy works	307
Notes	314
Bibliography	351
Index	363
Acknowledgements	375